Mobile Advertising and Attitudes of Consumers: A Bibliometric Analysis

Dr. Savita Rastogi¹, Satyam²

¹Associate Professor, Department of Commerce, Jesus and Mary College, University of Delhi ²Assistant Professor, Department of Management Studies, Shaheed Sukhdev College of Business studies, University of Delhi

Abstract:

Bibliometric analysis approach has gained prominence to analyze the literature in recent times. Adopting this approach this study gives an overview of the field of mobile advertising. There has been a shift in the way consumers respond to advertisement targeting them through mobile phones as an advertising channel. Mobile advertising provides flexibility for customers to receive advertisements without time and geographical constraints. Innovations in smart phone technology are providing new avenues to marketers and business organizations. The present study reviews the publication trend in the field of mobile advertising. SCOPUS data base was used to extract 200 articles on mobile advertising from the year 2005 to 2021 and VOS viewer software version 1.6.17 was utilized by the researchers to visualize the scientific landscape of mobile advertising research. The researchers found that Ajen, Fishbein, Barnes, Okazaki, Davis Haghirian, Karjaluoto, Ducoffee are the most cited authors in the field of mobile advertising & attitudes of consumers. Journal of Advertising research, International Journal of Mobile marketing, Journal of Interactive Marketing, Computers in Human Behaviour and Journal of Marketing Research are the prominent journals in the field of mobile advertising. The network maps prepared by using co-citation analysis and bibliographic coupling revealed the trends and patterns in field of mobile advertising and provided directions for future research.

Keywords: mobile advertising, attitude, consumer, sms advertising, mobile commerce.

Date of Submission: 24-09-2022

Date of Acceptance: 08-10-2022

I. Introduction

The innovations in the field of smart phone technology have revolutionized the field of advertising and business communications (Newell & Meier, 2007). With the advancement in technology and COVID-19 pandemic, there is a behavioural shift in consumer attitude towards mobile advertising and communications. In this transition phase the business organizations are coming up with new techniques and methods to target the consumers (Kim, 2020). The field of mobile advertising is not new. Since last two decades the business organizations have made use of mobile advertising as an advertising channel. The marketers are now trying to find new avenues in this growing mobile phone market (Tapanainen et. al., 2020). Mobile phones help marketers to advertise without time and geographical limitations. This rapid growth of mobile advertising has attracted the attention of researchers. On an average Indians consumed 14.6 GB data per smartphone per month and this is expected to triple in next five years. Not only in India but the world over there has been an upsurge in use of smart phone by the people (Ericsson¹ Mobility Report 2021).

II. Review of Literature

Attitude is a person's learned predisposition driving that person to respond (Fishbein & Ajen, 1975). Attitude comprises of favourable and unfavourable feelings towards marketing and advertising (Zaremohzzabieh et al., 2020). Attitude helps to explain an individual's behavior (Richard & Chandra, 2005). Intention to perform a behaviour is determined by a person's attitude (Xu, 2006). Factors such as perceived entertainment, credibility and information improve consumers' attitude towards in-app/mobile advertisements (Sigurdsson et al.) Informativeness and irritation have greater impact on prevention-focused consumers than on promotion focused consumers. But entertainment and social norms have more effect on promotion-focused consumers (Kim, 2020). A mobile advertising is entertaining, informative, reliable, personalized and sent with

^{1.} https://www.ericsson.com/en/reports-and-papers/mobility-report/reports/november-2021

permission so it has positive effect on creating attitudes towards it. (Unal et al., 2011). Product involvement, appeal & entertainment have a positive impact on attitude towards mobile advertising. Permission and monetary benefits were found to have significant impact on attitudes of consumers (Aslam et al., 2016). The attributes of mobile marketing, the nature of information, excitement and attractiveness and credibility have effect on consumer attitudes towards mobile marketing (Yousif, 2012). Purchase intention is affected by perceived ease of use of app by mobile phone users (Fard et al., 2019). Mobile phone users' attitudes are influenced by infotainment, irritation and subjective norms and the impact of these factors on intention to purchase is mediated by attitudes (Hongyan&Zhankui, 2017). Localization and perceived enjoyment influence mobile phone users' intention to watch in app advertisements (Tapanainen et al., 2020). The consumers perception of a brand's ethical value is influenced by their attitude towards mobile behavioural advertising of that brand (Mpinganjira&Maduku, 2018). Individual differences are stronger determinants of response to mobile advertising as compared to permission and incentive (Varnali et al., 2012). The three important variables that may influence consumer's acceptance of mobile advertising are user permission, wireless service provider control and brand trust. User permission was believed to be the most important variable, as consumers were seen to be fearful of SMS advertising and fearful of high levels of spam, as with email marketing. Permission marketing is the opposite of traditional interruption marketing. Permission marketing is about building an ongoing relationship of increasing depth with customers by obtaining customer consent to receive information from a company. Permitted messages can be modified as per time, location and personal characteristics to get closer to the user (Barnes &Scornavacca, 2004). Location based mobile advertising is creating 5-10 times higher click rates in comparison to traditional mobile advertising messages (Ververidis&Polyzos 2002). Mobile advertising campaigns can generate responses that are as high as 40% in comparison to 3% response rate via direct mail and 1% via internet banner ads (Jelassi& Enders 2004).

III. Purpose of Study

The basic purpose of present study is to comprehensively study the field of mobile advertising by using bibliometric analysis approach. The objectives are :

- 1. To identify the most prolific and influential authors in the field of study.
- 2. To identify the most influential work in the field of study.

V.

3. To identify the patterns of co-operation and collaboration among authors and countries.

IV. Research Methodology

The present study used Bibliometric analysis as the research methodology. The data was accessed from Scopus database. Scopus is the largest abstract and citation database of peer – reviewed literature and includes more than 22,700 journals from international publishers. Scopus is a broader database in comparison to Web of Science (WOS). 200 articles pertaining to mobile advertising and attitude of consumers were extracted from Scopus data base from year 2005-2021. To achieve the objectives of the study VOS viewer software version 1.6.17 was used to visualise scientific landscape of the field of mobile advertising. The major advantage of using this software is the easy visualization of networks. There are various options in VOS viewer software like zoom in, zoom out, scrolling, searching which help in detailed analysis of a pattern or map. Extracted data from Scopus was saved as .csv format so that it could be used later for bibliometric analysis.

Inclusion-Exclusion criteria

The present research reviewed articles published in journals from the year 2005-2021 and were extracted using Scopus database. We have included articles published in English language from the following subject areas :- Business, Management, Commerce, Accounting, Decision Sciences, Psychology and Economics.We have excluded the conference papers, conference reviews, book chapters and reviews.

Results and discussions

V.1 Cited Authors Co-citation Analysis

According to Kumar (2015), co-citation is said to occur when the referred article refers two papers simultaneously. In other words, co-citation analysis involves tracking pairs of papers that are cited together in source articles. When the same pairs of papers are co-cited by many authors, clusters are formed. Co-citation analysis is used to study the intellectual structure of a research from the perspective of cited authors or sources. Co-citation analysis using author as the unit of analysis by VOS viewer software was performed. All the authors having minimum number of citations 50 and minimum total link strength (TLS) of 400 were included out of a total of 11,675 authors cited in 200 documents. For details see Table I -Cited Authors Co-citation in Appendix. 23 authors met the threshold criteria of minimum 50 citations and minimum 400 TLS as shown in figure I.



In the figure each node represented an author and its size indicated the number of times the author had been referenced or cited in 200 documents. A link between two nodes indicated a co-citation relationship. Higher is the strength of link, greater is the thickness in the figure. The VOS viewer software identified 3 clusters. The nodes with same color belong to a cluster.

Cluster 1 in red color had the highest number of authors. Out of the 11 authors in cluster1, Barnes was the most important in terms of highest number of 114 citations followed by Okazaki (112 citations), Karjaluoto (107 citations) and Haghirian (103 citations). Of all the authors in this cluster Karjaluoto had the highest total link strength of 1891 followed by 1719 of Barnes. The authors included in this cluster have predominantly worked on effectiveness of mobile advertising.

Cluster 2 in green color includes 6 authors. Out of the 6 authors, Ajen's work done in collaboration with Fishbein titled "Belief, attitude, intention and behaviour: An introduction to theory & research' emerged as the highly cited work (179 citations) in mobile advertising. It was followed by works of Fishbein (113) and Davis (105). In factAjen's Theory of Planned behaviour is the most widely accepted theory to understand attitude and intention of consumers.

Cluster 3 in blue color is comprised of authors like Ducoffe (82 citations), who has emerged as having highest citations in cluster 3. Ducoffe is followed by Lutz (70 citations) and Mackenzie (70 citations). The authors in this cluster have worked on how consumers perceive mobile advertising and which factors affect their attitude.

V.2 Co-citation Analysis of journals

Co-citation analysis was performed with journal as the unit of analysis. This analysis was performed using VOS viewer software and was analysed with full counting method. For generating a meaningful co-citation network, threshold criteria of 24 minimum citations was used by researcher. This resulted in a total of 50 cited journals/sources. Out of 4271 journals, 50 journals met the threshold criteria of 24 minimum citations. For details see Table II - Co-citation of Journals in Appendix.

Figure II shows the co-citation pattern of 50 sources cited at least 24 times by studies in our sample.



Cluster 1 in red color contains 26 journals and consists of wide variety of journals which include Journal of Advertising Research (404 citations, TLS =11,414). This journal was most important in terms of number of citations. This was followed by International Journal of Mobile marketing (162 citations, TLS = 5074), Psychology and Marketing (66 citations, TLS =2390) and Management Science (62 citations, TLS =1816). Almost all journals are high impact factor journals.

Cluster 2 in green color contains 14 journals. In this cluster the most important journal is Journal of Advertising (286 citations, TLS =9426). The others are Journal of Interactive Marketing (citations = 217, TLS = 6888), followed by Computers in Human Behaviour (194 citations, TLS = 7099), International Journal of Advertising (179 citations, TLS =5869) and Journal of Business Research (143 citations, TLS = 5262).

Cluster -3 in blue comprises of 10 journals. The most impactful among them being Journal of Marketing Research (199 citations, TLS =6697). This is followed by Journal of Consumer Research (197 citations, TLS=6187) and Journal of Consumer Psychology (31 citations, TLS = 1124).

V.3Bibliographic coupling with documents as unit of analysis

The concept of bibliographic coupling was given by Kessler in 1963. Two articles are considered to be bibliographically coupled when they refer to a common third article in their reference list. The strength of bibliographic coupling increases if there is an increase in the number of references that two articles commonly refer to in their reference list. Threshold limit was taken as minimum 20 citations. Out of 200 documents, 46 met the threshold. Documents having TLS more than 40 were taken. For details see Table III- Bibliographic Coupling with documents included in analysis was 30 as shown in Figure III. Figure III. Documents Bibliographic couplingnetwork



Cluster 1 (in red color) is the largest cluster having 11 documents. The most cited articles in this cluster are Xu, D.J., (2006) cited 220 times followed by Parreno (2013) cited 93 times. This cluster predominantly comprises of articles on consumer attitudes towards mobile advertising.

Cluster 2 (in green color) was having 10 documents. The most cited articles in this cluster are Muk (2015) cited 70 times followed by Soroa-Koury (2010) cited 61 times. This cluster predominantly comprises of articles on factors affecting mobile advertising.

Cluster 3 (in blue color) had 9 documents. The most cited articles in this cluster are Bellman (2011) cited 148 times followed by Bart (2014) cited 34 times. This cluster predominantly comprises of articles on effectiveness of mobile advertising.

V.4 Country Co-Authorship network analysis

This network helps us to study the amount of collaboration between authors, organizations and countries. Co-authorship is a type of synergy effect in the field of research. Figure 4 shows the co-authorship network of author-affiliated countries having at least 1 citation and at least 3 documents as the threshold limit. Out of 56 countries, 20 met the threshold but countries having TLS = 0 were not taken. So the figure 4 shows total 10 countries. VOS viewer software clustered the 10 countries into 4 clusters using the modularity method. For details see Table IV - Country Co-Authorship in Appendix.

Figure IV shows that USA was having the highest total link strength (TLS) among all the countries.



Figure IV. Country Co-Authorship network

Cluster 1 comprises of Australia, Finland, South Korea and Vietnam shown with red color. These countries had a strong collaboration network in field of mobile advertising. Australia had the highest number of citations in this cluster (431 citations).

Cluster 2 comprised of France and Germany shown in green color.

Cluster 3 comprised of USA and Netherlands shown in blue color. USA (43 documents and 265 citations) was followed by Netherlands (89 citations).

Cluster 4 comprised of China and Taiwan shown in yellow color. China (14 documents and 406 citations) Taiwan (18 documents and 38 citations).

V.5 Keyword co-occurrence network analysis

Author keyword co-occurrence analysis helps to understand the thematic knowledge of a research field. In other words it helps us to understand the research trend. VOS viewer software was used to generate keyword cooccurrence network. A total of 672 keywords were extracted using software and the threshold limit was taken as 5. Out of 672 keywords, 22 met the threshold limit. The method adopted was association strength. Keyword which was a repetition (like plural of a keyword) was not included in network. For details see Table V-Keyword Co-occurrence in Appendix. So finally, 19 keywords were selected using VOS viewer software which generated a co-occurrence network as shown in figure V.



Figure V. Keyword co-occurrence network

Cluster 1 in red color had 8 keywords out of which mobile advertising is at the centre stage of the map or network with 64 occurrences and highest total link strength of 73. This shows that mobile advertising concept is largely studied concept by researchers followed by attitude (24 occurrences), purchase intention (12 occurrences), mobile commerce (9 occurrences).

Cluster 2 in green color had 6 keywords out of which mobile marketing had the maximum occurrences (26 occurrences). It was followed by advertising (20 occurrences), sms advertising (12 occurrences) and social media (10 occurrences).

Cluster-3 in blue color had 5 keywords out of which entertainment (10 occurrences), informativeness (8 occurrences), irritation (8 occurrences) credibility (5 occurrences) were depicted by VOS viewer software.

Hence it can be concluded that Ajen, Fishbein, Barnes, Okazaki, Davis Haghirian, Karjaluoto, Ducoffee are the most cited authors in the field of mobile advertising & attitudes of consumers. Journal of Advertising research, International Journal of Mobile marketing, Journal of Interactive Marketing, Computers in Human Behaviour and Journal of Marketing Research are the prominent journals in the field of mobile advertising.

VI. Limitations and further research

Bibliometric analysis tells us that the researchers have investigated mobile advertising using quantitative data and there is lack of qualitative studies. The present study is restricted to Scopus database only. Future researchers should expand the scope of present study by using other data bases also. The present study has used only VOS viewer as the bibliometric tool. Future researchers can expand the scope by using other bibliometric tools like Gephi, Histcite, Bibexel etc.Despite the above limitations this study provides a comprehensive analysis of research on mobile advertising which would be beneficial to both academicians and practitioners.

References:-

- Aslam, W., Batool, M., &Haq, Z.U. (2016). Attitudes and behaviour of the mobile phone users towards sms advertising: A study in an emerging economy. Journal of Management Sciences, 3 (1), 62-80.
- [2]. Barnes, S.J., &Scornavacca, E. (2004). Mobile marketing: the role of permission and acceptance. International Journal of Mobile Communications, 2(2), 128-139.
- [3]. Fard, M.H., &Marvi, R. (2019). Viral Marketing and purchase intentions of mobile applications users. International Journal of Emerging Markets, 15, 287-301.
- [4]. Fishbein, M., &Ajen, I. (1975). Belief attitude, intention &behaviour: An introduction to theory and research. Reading, MA : Addison Wesley.
- [5]. Hongyan, L., &Zhankui, C. (2017). Effects of mobile text advertising on consumer purchase intention: A moderated mediation analysis. Frontiers in Psychology, 8, 1022.

- [6]. Jelassi, T., & Enders, A. (2004, June 14-16). Leveraging wireless technology for mobile advertising. [Conference Presentation] 12th European Conference on Information Systems, Turku, Finland.
- [7]. Kim, M., (2020). Determinant of young consumers attitude toward mobile advertising: The role of regulatory focus. Journal of Promotion Management, 26, 186-206.
- [8]. Mpinganjira, M., &Maduku, D.K. (2018). Ethics of mobile behavioural advertising: Antecedents and outcomes of perceived ethical value of advertised brands. Journal of Business Research, 95, 464-478.
- [9]. Newell, J. & Meier, M. (2007). Desperately seeking opt-in: A field report from a student-led mobile marketing initiative.
- International Journal of Mobile Marketing. 2 (2), 53-57.
- [10]. Richard, M.O., & Chandra, R. (2005). A model of consumer web navigational behaviour : Conceptual development and application. Journal of Business Research, 58, 1019-1029.
- [11]. Sigurdsson, V., Menon, R.V., Hallgrimsson, A.G., Larsen, N.M., &Fagerstorm, A., (2018). Factors affecting attitudes and behavioural intentions towards in –app mobile advertisements. Journal of Promotion Management, 24 (5), 694-714.
- [12]. Tapanainen, T., Dao, T.K., Nguyen, T.T.H., Pham, T.A.D., & Nguyen, D.N., (2020). An extension of theory of planned behaviour for in –app advertisements: The case of Vietnamese young mobile users. Journal of Information Technology Applications & Management, 17 (1), 147-171.
- [13]. Unal, S., Ercis, A., &Keser, E. (2011). Attitudes towards mobile advertising a research to determine the differences between the attitudes of youth and adults. [Conference Proceedings] 7th International Strategic Management Conference Proceedia Social and Behavioural Sciences, 24, 361-377.
- [14]. Varnali, K., Yilmaz, C., & Toker, A. (2012). Predictors of attitudinal and behavioural outcomes in mobile advertising: A field experiment. Electronic Commerce Research and applications, 3, 570-581.
- [15]. Ververidis, C., &Polyzos, G., (2002). Mobile marketing using location based services. [Conference Presentation] First International Conference on Mobile Business, Athens, Greece.
- [16]. Xu, D.J., Liao, S.K., & Tang, H., (2005). The importance of personalization in affecting consumer attitudes toward mobile advertising in China.Journal of Computer Information Systems, 47(2), 9-19.
- [17]. Yousif, R.O. (2012). Factors affecting consumer attitudes towards mobile marketing. Database Marketing and Customer Strategy Management, 19, 147-162.
- [18]. Zaremohazzabieh, Z., Ahrari, S., Krauss, S.E., Samah, A.B.A., Meng, L.K., &Ariffin, Z. (2019). Predicting social entrepreneurial intention: A meta-analytic path analyses based on theory of planned behaviour. Journal of Business Research, 96, 264-276.

Appendix

Table I - Cited Authors Co-citation

S.No.	id	author	citations	total link strength
1	140	ajzen, i.	179	2431
2	564	bagozzi, r.p.	76	1185
3	675	barnes, s.j.	114	1719
4	704	barwise, p.	55	844
5	2303	davis, f.d.	105	1401
6	2517	dickinger, a.	52	797
7	2684	ducoffe, r.h.	82	993
8	3075	fishbein, m.	113	1614
9	3136	fornell, c.	53	649
10	3829	haghirian, p.	103	1472
11	3840	hair, j.f.	64	817
12	5070	karjaluoto, h.	107	1891
13	5957	leppaniemi, m.	74	1347
14	6010	li, h.	60	651
15	6401	lutz, r.j.	69	881
16	6459	mackenzie, s.b.	70	856
17	7273	murphy, j.	50	769
18	7668	okazaki, s.	112	1519
19	8108	petty, r.e.	55	400
20	8540	reichardt, t.	55	911
21	9203	scornavacca, e.	53	869
22	10376	tsang, m.m.	70	1040
23	10630	venkatesh, v.	66	972

	Table II - Co-citation Analysis of Journals					
S.No.	id	Source / Journal	citations	total link strength		
1	754	computers in human behavior	194	7099		
2	895	decision support systems	58	1976		
3	1694	international journal of advertising	179	5869		
4	1797	international journal of mobile marketing	162	5074		
5	2141	journal of advertising	286	9426		
6	2143	journal of advertising research	404	11414		
7	2189	journal of business research	143	5262		
8	2216	journal of consumer psychology	31	1124		
9	2217	journal of consumer research	197	6187		
10	2307	journal of interactive advertising	150	5160		
11	2309	journal of interactive marketing	217	6888		
12	2352	journal of marketing research	199	6697		
13	2601	management science	62	1816		
14	3377	psychological bulletin	34	1020		
15	3396	psychology & marketing	66	2390		

Table II - Co-citation Analysis of Journals

Table III - Bibliographic Coupling with documents

		Table III - Bibliographic Coupi		
S.No.	id	document	citations	total link strength
1	88	lee eb. (2017)	21	113
2	98	feng x. (2016)	25	109
3	115	lee s. (2015)	48	78
4	121	gazley a. (2015)	25	113
5	128	limj.s. (2015)	32	45
6	129	muk a. (2015)	70	60
7	139	le t.d. (2014)	45	89
8	140	ha y.w. (2014)	69	114
9	146	bart y. (2014)	34	59
10	150	drossos d. (2013)	29	115
11	151	yang b. (2013)	41	122
12	153	parreñoj.m. (2013)	93	127
13	155	mohdnoorm.n. (2013)	38	168
14	156	richardj.e. (2013)	26	140
15	162	okazaki s. (2012)	28	71
16	164	varnali k. (2012)	29	96
17	165	bellman s. (2011)	148	61
18	170	lee cc. (2011)	76	110
19	176	rau pl.p. (2011)	29	54
20	178	moynihan b. (2010)	83	85
21	181	soroa-koury s. (2010)	61	108
22	184	phaui. (2009)	78	86
23	185	xu h. (2009)	26	126
24	189	tripathis.n. (2008)	30	41
25	193	yang k.c.c. (2007)	27	81

Mobile Advertising	g and Attitudes of	Consumers : A	Bibliometric Analysis
--------------------	--------------------	---------------	-----------------------

26	194	okazaki s. (2007b)	37	62
27	196	haghirian p. (2007)	50	96
28	198	xu d.j. (2006)	220	79
29	199	lee sf. (2006)	38	80
30	200	tsangm.m. (2004)	20	88

Table IV - Country Co-Authorship

S.No.	id	country	documents	citations	total link strength
1	2	australia	14	431	3
2	7	china	14	406	4
3	14	finland	3	16	3
4	15	france	4	10	2
5	16	germany	3	17	1
6	32	netherlands	3	89	2
7	45	south korea	19	71	5
8	47	taiwan	18	38	4
9	54	united states	43	265	14
10	55	vietnam	4	809	4

Table V - Keyword Co-occurrence					
S.No.	id	keyword	occurrences	total link strength	
1	24	advertising	20	15	
2	53	attitude	24	31	
3	89	brand attitude	7	5	
4	123	consumer acceptance	5	6	
5	128	consumer behaviour	7	7	
6	150	credibility	5	21	
7	209	entertainment	10	34	
8	287	informativeness	8	29	
9	309	irritation	8	25	
10	328	location-based advertising	6	3	
11	368	mobile advertising	64	73	
12	377	mobile commerce	9	13	
13	388	mobile marketing	26	31	
14	393	mobile phone	5	7	
15	471	personalization	8	11	
16	510	purchase intention	12	21	
17	566	sms advertising	12	19	
18	582	social media	10	5	
19	629	theory of planned behavior	5	2	

Table V - Keyword Co-occurrence

Dr. Savita Rastogi. "Mobile Advertising and Attitudes of Consumers: A Bibliometric Analysis." *IOSR Journal of Business and Management (IOSR-JBM)*, 24(10), 2022, pp. 18-27.